

City of Green River

460 East Main Street, Green River, Utah
City Council Minutes
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, October 13, 2020

ATTENDING: Mayor Travis Bacon, Council Members Kathy Ryan, Larry Packer, Bo Harrison and Kent Nelson; Employees Conae Black, Julie Spadafora, Bryan Meadows, Phillip Stubblefield, Robin Hunt, Loni Meadows, Chad Pinneo; Citizens Bridget Meadows, Gwen Pinneo, Ren Hatt, Maria Sykes, John Curtis, Bryan Fahney, Corey Jorman, Lauri Faulk, Sandra Koon, Sara Good, Dylan Keele, Wade Ryan, Jeff Black, Gayna Salinas, Justin Queen, Doug Tolman, Emily Mora, Frances Erlandsen, Royd Hatt, Steph Crabtree, Scott Ryan, Darcy Quist, Lacy Harrison,
ABSENT: Michael Silliman

CONDUCTING: Mayor Travis Bacon, the meeting began at 7:16 p.m.

ORDER OF BUSINESS:

Pledge of Allegiance was directed by Larry Packer.

1. Discuss/approve/deny consent agenda. **MOTION:** Kent Nelson made a motion to approve the consent agenda. Bo Harrison seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Kent Nelson, Bo Harrison, Kathy Ryan, Larry Packer voted aye. The motion carried.

September 8, 2020 regular meeting minutes
August 2020 financial report
September 2020 Treasurer's report
October 2020 Payment Approval report

2. Discuss/approve/deny a Proclamation Against Privatization of the United States Postal Service. Sarah Good of the Green River Post Office presented a document opposing the privatization of the United States Postal Services to the council. It is the grand alliance to save our post office in our rural communities. The document is a symbolic measure to show our support against privatization. Sarah Good spoke to the council about what this would mean for the small town of Green River to have our post office close down. The Mayor read the proclamation out loud and goes as follows:

Proclamation Against Privatization of the United States Postal Service

The U. S. Postal Service, which was created as the Post Office Department in 1972 has it founding principles in the U.S. Constitution. To this day, it remains a national treasure belonging to the people of this country.

The postal Service has remained a self-sustaining, independent establishment of the federal government that does not receive tax paper funding and relies solely on revenue derived from the sale of postal services and products.

The Postal Service employs more than 500,000 people who are at the center of a \$1.4 trillion, 7/5 million employee mailing industry that has a positive economic impact on our community. The agency serves the needs of more than 157 million business and residential customers through its affordable universal network, providing service six and sometimes seven days a week.

This universal network connects the country's rural, suburban and urban communities at fair and reasonable rate, providing equal access no matter who are and where we are located. This unmatched infrastructure coupled and dedicated workforce is the reason that the Postal Service is consistently the highest-rated agency of the federal government. In fact, a Pew Research Center poll, released in February 2018, showed that the Postal Service has an 88% favorability rating.

The Postal Service remains the nation's second largest employer of the military veterans and is a source of dignified union jobs and equal pay for workers from all back grounds, including women and people of color. These employees are dedicated public servants who do more than process and deliver the nation's mail. They serve as the eyes and ears of the nation's communities and often respond first in situations involving health, safety and crime.

We know that if the USPS is privatized in whole or in part, the decision to provide services will be based on whether a company can make a profit rather than what's good for our communities.

Inevitably, privatization will lead to increased rates and diminished services for customers, especially in the rural communities and potentially in low-income urban areas.

Privatization of the Postal Service would jeopardize the booming commerce sector and cripple a major part of the nation's critical infrastructure during a time where methods of communication are constantly changing, while mail, including letters, cards, periodicals, medicines, catalogs and packages, continues to be invaluable to individuals and businesses.

Recently, the White House Office of Management and Budget and the Presidential Task Force unveiled plans for partial or total privatization of the Postal Service. Privatization will harm workers, communities, and businesses who are currently well-served by the Postal Service.

The City of Green River City Council goes on record opposing the privatization of the Postal Service so it remains an independent establishment of the federal government. **MOTION:** Kent Nelson made a motion to approve the Proclamation against Privatization of the United States Postal Service. Kathy Ryan seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Kent Nelson, Bo Harrison, Kathy Ryan and Larry Packer voted aye. The motion carried.

3. Discussion on scope, size and nature of the EPA Brownfield Community-Wide Assessment funding request. Public comments are encouraged.

Conae Black addressed the city about putting in an application for an EPA Brownfield Community wide assessment grant which is a very competitive grant. It is federally funded and only about eight-seven grants will be awarded nationwide. The application is due on October 28, 2020. The city will identify all the possible sites in Green River with potential hazardous waste and petroleum oil based properties or asbestos waste properties that are not being used or are not in operation. This includes any sites that have used underground storage tanks. We have identified around ten so far and does not include any abandoned motel sites. This grant will help to safely clean up all properties. It is a very difficult one to come by and we almost believe there is a very good chance we will not receive it this year but once established it will be a lot easier next year. Once we have identified possible sites then they can go after funding to help clean up the sites. Better City will assist in writing this grant along with advice from the State of Utah Department of Environmental Quality.

4. Public Hearing to hear comments on the proposed 2021 fiscal year budget.

Conae Black spoke to the council and public about the team that was put together to address an employee compensation plan. Those team members were Conae Black, Mayor Bacon, Finance Director Cameron Willford, Phillip Stubblefield and Bryan Meadows. She said this was a project she has been pushing and working on for years. Kathy Ryan being a member of the City Council for a long time has been involved in helping us resolve the concerns that the employees have. There have been current Council members, former Council members who have done a lot of work with this to figure out the right plan of action. For years any time an employee got a raise it would have to go before the City Council and the City Council would use their own personal experiences or their own personal lives to make a decision and it was just very frustrating for the employees. We tried working with the step and grade system we tried hiring an outside agency, Payscale. We hired Payscale and we learned a lot of good things along the way each time. It was all a good experience. One of the things we learned about Payscale was that it was a company that went around gathering a lot of data and information. They would gather it nationwide or state wide and you could make the decision to have it gather information nationwide or state wide. We chose to use the data within the State of Utah and just government employees. They did a market analysis and made determination of what employees' wages should be. So that is where we are now. It has been a big struggle just to get the wages up to the

fiftieth percentile range. We are not Salt Lake City we are just little Green River. We are not asking for one hundred percent but just to get up to the fiftieth percentile. Some of the concerns of the previous council is we are not Salt Lake City or Provo Utah we are just little old Green River and we have a certain amount of budget. This helped us to do a comparison of other city's based upon their budget. Payscale doesn't have that capability. So I went out and researched. Utah has a transparency web site and on that site it shows what Conae Black is making including benefits. I did a budget comparison with other municipalities with similar budgets. Some with a little above our budget and some with a budget a little lower than our annual budget. I gathered up information like wages for similar employees such as City Administrators, Code Enforcement Officers, City Recorder, City Managers, Public Works Directors, City Treasurers, City Clerks and Volunteer Firefighters all the way up to your directors. This information was presented to our team. Cameron Willford even went out to other municipalities and gathered information and then all data was put together to determine what the wages would be. We included all employees but not all employees are eligible for a pay increase to get us up to the fifty percentile. The budget increase would be a little over the fifty thousand. The fifty thousand budget change was given to the council. The budget increases are on this form. All the blues on this side are our revenues and all the reds on the other side are your expenses. With the budget amendments the overall revenue increase would be about three hundred dollars. The overall expense increase will be fifty-two thousand. It will not raise our taxes or water and sewer rates, it is within our budget to do this. She came up with more revenue than expense. This is a public hearing to hear the public comment on the increase in the budget. So we will open it up for public comment.

Bridgett Meadows, commented that when we gather information we need to consider that all of the employees working for the City actually do more than one job. Bryan and his crew do water, sewer and streets. So when you're gathering your data we need to consider that. Conae Black as the City Administrator wears more than one hat. I know Loni Meadows does more than just one thing and Julie Spadafora too. When we are looking at this we need to consider dependability as well as the different hats that they wear and the shoes that they fill and their longevity because they have been there for so long and the employees that have not are also very dependable and are hard workers. I think that speaks volumes. I love that Conae Black mentioned that sometimes in the past they have taken personal opinion against the criteria that they are facing. You just can't do that you can't compare dollars to donuts. You can't compare Bo Harrison's job to Bryan Meadow's job or Loni Meadows job to Kent Nelson's job or whatever. It should be let's evaluate the person and what they are doing in general aspects and do I think what you're doing is great. I think you're getting quite the package in your employees and they are pretty incredible.

Royd Hatt asked, "What the criteria is and how is it set up?" Do they have a step and grade? What is your system and how does it work? Conae answered back, "We are trying to go within the marketing range." Royd Hatt, asked "Meaning?" Ren Hatt asked, "So it could fluctuate greatly within the market". Conae Black answered, yes. Ren Hatt asked, Green River's market doesn't fluctuate? Conae Black answered, usually government agencies do not fluctuate much, and the only fluctuation is the amount of grants we receive or if we add more growth. They usually fluctuate in the positive and not in the negative. Covid is a concern but it hasn't affected Green River City that much. Royd Hatt asked, "What would constitute someone getting a raise?" Conae answered, "It would get us within the fifty percentile range." Royd Hatt said, "No, I am not talking about this I am talking about anytime someone is getting a raise it must go before the City Council, it's not like I have a higher career or education so I can run the water plant better so I get a raise?" Conae Black answered, "We can work that all out through the employee policy hand book." Mayor Bacon and the council answered, "It would be a performance plan." Kathy Ryan commented, "Get it set up so it will just come. The employee will be rated and if we have some form of performance plan set up then the employee will be able to receive a raise periodically or at least have a COLA. So we at least stay up to the fiftieth percentile. Royd Hatt asked, "Who would evaluate the employee?" Conae Black answered, "The department heads which would be the supervisors or directors and then the Mayor would evaluate each one of the directors. Mayor Bacon commented that we are still working on the other piece of the puzzle to

formalize it. Bo Harrison stated most employees say that they are underpaid and overworked and not overpaid and under worked. So an employee is not happy with their wages. Did the city just pay them a lot of time to give themselves a raise? Is that what happened? Kathy Ryan answered, "No". Mayor Bacon answered, "This is something that has been in the working for a very long time. Bo Harrison said, Cameron Willford's power point presentation wasn't data, it was just a bunch of numbers shown on a power point. He has compared Green River to Wellington, Helper, Escalante, Gunnison, Salina, Castle Dale and Manti which every one of these cities have more population except for Escalante. Comparing apples to apples the Public Works Director average wages with benefits is \$78,000 a year. Sorry, I am not attacking any employees here. I appreciate all the employees and what they do, they are wonderful. What my concern is that their positions are not worth the amount of money they are looking for. Our Public Works Director 2 years ago made with wages and benefits \$85,000. He is already making \$7,000 above the average for these seven towns that I looked at. They are close to Green River and relatively the same size, excuse me, nearly 1 1/2 to 2 times the size of Green River and I don't see Cameron Willford's numbers. I don't see where he got them? He used a lot of towns and number from Idaho which is great, but I don't really care about Idaho. Bridget Meadows asked if they are going by the budget size or population. Bryan Meadows commented that Castle Dale is not a comparison they do not have water, sewer or streets department. They have a Special Service Water District. Castle Dale doesn't have nearly the responsibilities Green River has. Conae Black confirmed the committee went by budget and not by population size to determine the wages. Mayor Bacon commented that we have a very sizeable budget compared to many of the other cities that are bigger than we are. He said Cameron Willford didn't include all the raw data because there was so much of it.

Kent Nelson asked, if the grants are included in the budget comparison because most grants cannot be used for wages. Are we just going off our revenue we bring in from the sewer and water? He just wants to know that there is enough money there. Conae Black answered, yes grants are included in your budget but frees up your budget for more operational costs. Kent Nelson commented, that makes sense. Yes, we have this large budget and we have lots of grants that help us take care of our roads, water and sewer. I want to make sure that the money is really there I am not against the raises I just hoped it would be spread out over multiple years rather than the lump sum that's being thrown at them. I would like to be part of some discussions with individual employees and to be able to get to know them rather than just having it thrown at us at the last minute. Conae Black answered, that's why we brought it to you before the public hearing so it wasn't just thrown at you. Ren Hatt also commented, It's still a pretty short amount of time. Conae Black commented, this is a new council and it's something new to him, but you guys all had that opportunity to come to the public meetings any time you want. Ren Hatt commented, this compensation plan has been in the working for a very long time. Ren Hatt commented, in terms of this public hearing all I have heard say that there is going to be an extra \$100,000 in the budget and it would only be a \$50,000 cost. I haven't seen anything on a website that shows me how those numbers break down. As a city member how am I going to be informed about it if it's just being presented to me just barely? If your saying I should have come to the meetings for 4 or 5 years then I would have gotten the numbers. As far as I know those papers were only handed to the City Council. Conae Black answered, that she was just informed the public on the proposed budget increase is. Ren Hatt asked, where is that coming from because all I am hearing is the number and not been hearing where the budget increase is happening or how the revenue is increasing. Mayor Bacon explained, Cameron Willford had some figures which are on that general line if you're interested we can sure provide that for you. So you can see exactly what is going on. Conae Black explained, to answer your question, the general funds revenue and expenses need to zero out. So there's a \$16,800 increase in the in the general fund revenue that is coming from your property taxes. I am a very conservative person and was concerned about COVID impacts so the original 2021 budget we budgeted \$245,000 for taxes and last year we received \$290,636.36. Property taxes are not going to change. We are not increasing your property taxes it was just under budgeted. Ren Hatt commented, so the \$50,000 is ongoing? Conae Black explained, so the \$16,800 from the general fund is coming from a budget increase in the property taxes line item. Another budget increase is coming from the Highway Sales and

Use fund. Again we are not raising taxes and it was under budgeted and that is a \$2,000.00 increase in that fund. In your Water Fund the water sales were again under budgeted and that is a \$20,000 increase in that fund. In your Sewer Fund there is a \$54,000 increase in your revenue but the expense side is only \$6,200. The last fund is Museum Fund, where there is a \$10,500 increase in the revenue side \$7,650 increase on expense side. Ren Hatt, asked, so is it ongoing? Is it something that is always going to be there? Are you always going to under budget and over deliver? Are you always going to do that with the same margin, because if not the immediate bump in raises and wages of that amount seems fiscally irresponsible as a City? Can you still continue to make the wages year after year? Conae Black answered, yes. Ren Hatt responded, you can promise with certainty you're always going to budget conversantly, always over on water and sewer? Conae Black answered, our employees are very talented and creative, they have a lot of ability they have a lot of insights and they have a lot of strengths. Not only do these employees look out for more revenue sources but they also look for ways to cut expenses all the time. Bridget Meadows commented, a normal employee from a gas station will be on the clock from 9 to 5 but the employee of the City Works will be on the clock 24-7 with the phone ringing all weekend long when they are on call. They're on the clock 24-7 but only paid for the hours they are called out and you never hear anyone complain about it and it really saves the city a lot of money. They do a lot of things and they add a lot of extra's and I think that there is value in that.

Kent Nelson commented that as a new council member it's not his fault that the city hasn't had something in the past where the city employees were given a raise every year like they should have or some kind of step and grade. It's not his fault he wasn't here and knows that it has been an ongoing problem for years. Conae Black confirmed, that there have been some gradual increases over the years. Kent Nelson commented he knows there has been increases but they couldn't unless it was taken before the council first. He doesn't think that is right, because most government agencies have some sort of step and grade process where they get paid more every year. His question is, are we setting up that process or are we just handing out a huge raise to everybody? I just feel if we are just handing out raises how is it going to solve the problem? Kathy Ryan, commented, we have been trying to set up some sort of process for the past 12 years. Kent Nelson asked, what are we doing to set up that process? If your given a 20% increase in wages will you come back to us next year and say it is still not fair. I want something in place before I give a yes on this. A consistent constant thing so we can say, Bryan has been here for about 20 years and then if he could look ahead say 5 years and say this is where I will be if I stay here. That's what we need not just a \$50,000 increase in our budget every year or two. Kathy Ryan commented, that's what we have been working on for the past 10 to 12 years. Kent Nelson commented, then why hasn't it happened? Kathy Ryan answered, because it is a process. Mayor Travis Bacon answered, depending who was on the council there were a lot of diverse' opinions and were pretty adamant about a Step and Grade System and some not willing to go that direction and your absolutely right Kent if we do not address that fact then we will never fix the problem at hand. Conae Black commented, we are planning to put in the employee handbook an automatic COLA raise, 1 or 1 ½ percent or whatever percent the council decides on and the second one will be merit based. Kent Nelson commented, for me to vote for this it would have to be in place. Conae Black commented back, we are just asking to get us up to the fifty percentile. Bo Harrison commented, according to your data. Conae Black said back, if your wanting to go out and get your own and work on it I guess you can. Bo Harrison said he was finding his own data and then was looking at what Cameron Willford gave him. Bridget Meadows commented, but you were looking at the population not the budget they were given or the categories they were given. Bo Harrison commented, I don't know what else to go on. Conae Black said, you never asked me to see the work. Kent Nelson said, this is just my opinion, you can take it or leave it. In research you can pretty well back up whatever you want to back up with data and get the right numbers. You can pretty much justify whatever with research. Kathy Ryan commented, you have to compare apples to apples and oranges to oranges. Conae Black said, and this is exactly why employees do not take this to the council because there is always some push back always. Ren Hatt said, I hate to bring up this but you knew about this when you applied for this position. So you knew you must go before the council to get a raise. Conae

Black answered, not all municipalities do that. Ren Hatt answered, but ours does and you were hired by ours. He felt Conae Black was angry about it. Conae answered, Oh I am not angry. Ren Hatt, answered, I disagree about that. Conae Black answered, no you haven't seen me angry. Ren Hatt said the issue is that it is a free market out there and don't see that any of you are under such a contract that you decided that your particular expertise is so invaluable that you could leave and pursue other education or opportunities and so it sounds there's a little holding the council over a barrel in terms we have to make all this up and get us up to the fifty percentile but we are also doing that in a year where we have no idea how COVID is actually going to affect the City. I think we have a basic idea what the projection is. I have no idea how it is affecting day to day as a teacher. Conae Black commented, when she started her job she was hired on at \$9 per hour and she was thrilled. She was thrilled with my wage because of the benefits she received and has never asked for a pay increase for the twenty plus years she has been employed. She is not asking for her tonight. She has been working and doing this for the talented and great employees that the city has. So she is not angry, a little frustrated maybe. Kathy Ryan commented, it is frustrating because I have been here a long time with the council and we have tried to implement something permanent so they do not have to go before the council. I worked for UDOT for thirty years was very grateful, I started very low and its very important to have your employees on some kind of regiment. Ren Hatt commented, I do think they deserve a raise but they do need something in place. The raise they are asking for is substantial to bring it to where it is supposed to be. Bo Harrison asked, does the public know who is getting a raise and how much? For public comment I think that would be important don't you think. Some of the employees are getting a 20% increase in their wages? Conae Black answered, but it is still lower than the fifty percentile. Bo Harrison commented, according to your numbers. Bridget Meadows commented, how long has it been since they have had a significant raise other than a twenty-five cent cost of living raise? Bo Harrison asked, I thought that some employees received a three or four-dollar raise since Travis Bacon became Mayor. Mayor Bacon answered, there may have been a couple that did. Part of the reason we ended up with so many people below the fifty percentile is because not having something in place and we cannot emphasize it enough. We are not asking for the top just something right in the middle. This is the average, just fifty percent. Right in the middle, right smack dab in the middle. Kent Nelson commented, I like how the school does it, they send out a paper every year and I can look at it and say, if I stay working here I can get paid so many dollars and retire getting paid this much. I just do not understand why we just do not get something like this in place before we do this raise? Conae Black spoke, it sounds like School District uses a step and grade system. Bryan Meadows commented, when they first came at us with a Step and Grade is they wanted to leave us where we were and start there. We were already way low on the scale. They wanted to implement a Step and Grade and not bump us to where we should have been at that time. Conae Black commented, another problem I have with the Step and Grade is that some people get that wage increase and they do not deserve it. Mayor Bacon stated he worked in that system in the Federal Government and your absolutely right on that Conae Black. That happened a lot. Kent Nelson commented, it sounds better than what we are doing and is more fair to the public and to our employees. Mayor Bacon commented, I agree that sounds better than what we have in place because what we have now is entirely too arbitrary. Phillip Stubblefield said, I have worked in city and county government for forty years and what we are talking about is just a base rate. I will not be getting a raise. I have never seen this before in all the council and city meetings I have attended, since moving here I feel like a second rate citizen. The people that work for the City are the biggest investments you can make for the citizens of Green River. Depending on how they are trained and if we are able to keep them locally and or keep them from driving to Moab where they could make at least \$5 to \$10 per hour more which they can because he just looked at that for the Water Department. The workers at the Meeker Water Department in Colorado make a lot more money per hour than the City of Green River's Water Department. Our employees have a lot of other things they do as well. How many Council Members have taken a tour of the facilities and asked, what do you do at the water plant, what do you do on the streets, what do you with the sewer, what do you do there etc.? Instead we have people in the community say, why do they have two people riding around together? We were shorthanded one time and we had Chad Pinneo in the river trying to fix a pump alone. Kent Nelson commented, I am not saying they are not worth it. I am not against

the raises. Gwen Pinneo commented, you just want to wait until someone else thinks of another idea and then its 3 years later and they still do not have a raise and they are still doing the job of four men. Kent Nelson commented, let's get something where they can look and see what they will be getting as a pay raise each year. Conae Black commented, they will be getting a COLA raise each year. Kent Nelson said, it will be the COLA but it isn't yet, so let's vote on the pay raise and COLA at the same time and I will be all for it. In the mean time we will work it out. I hope to have it worked out in the next three months. Conae Black answered, we hope to have that in place by the end of this year. Kent Nelson said, that will work. Bridgett Meadows said, when they talk about the sewer they are literally talking about getting in a canoe and floating out into the sewer lagoons.

Phillip Stubblefield commented, the hardest thing that the Council people he has seen with private businesses, they do not get the benefits. They have the opportunity to make and have more money, that's true with us, we could quit and go into the private sector. We have a want to help the City be a part of Green River and make some accomplishments. So I just think we are worth more than what the people generally think. The thing is the public do not have a clue what they do. How to educate them might be the biggest issue. The best thing to do is to get onto a bus and tour around the facilities and get to know exactly what they do and are responsible for, especially if you're over a department. I have never seen a City Council run this way where they are over these people and the employees have to answer to the Council. Most municipalities have a City Manager that is over all those departments and they bring all those issues to the Council. The Council needs to approve the raises or make appointments to positions. I am amazed at how well these guys do and the efforts that they make. Kent Nelson said, I am not saying that I am against a huge raise because that isn't going to solve the problems without something in place. So let's get something in place let's get it done. Kathy Ryan commented, all Council should take a turn to follow these guys around and see what they do. Take the time to go look and actually see what they do. Kent Nelson commented, I have talked to Bryan Meadows and it just hasn't worked out. Philip Stubblefield commented, for instance with Bryan Meadows it seems that also Chad Pinneo is under his department and then there is Conae Black. I think with all these people sometimes you're thinking what direction should I go? All these people to please or answer to. I know that's what you guys set up but it becomes so confusing. Maybe I am getting to the area of complaints. When someone complains to a Council member and goes straight to the employee and tell them about it, that is the way it is supposed to be in Green River. The Council Member say I have heard this complaint and can you take care of it. Kathy Ryan commented, I go to the city employee and ask is there anything I can do for you or how can help? I will do anything I can. Philip Stubblefield said, if I don't like what Conae Black says I can go to the Mayor. Ren Hatt answered, that sounds like politics.

Mayor Bacon commented, It's a really complicated issue in a sense, it's been pending for a long time. I started to say how we ended up with so many employees below the fifty percentile was because of COLA raises. I can't remember exactly how it came up. I happened to be talking to Loni Meadows and I asked how was the COLA raise going. With the Federal government it just happens every year either 1.6 % or 2.4 % or somewhere in between and It was just automatic. I thought that was how it worked for Green River City. Loni told me right after I took over as Mayor that there hasn't been a COLA raise in about 5 years. It kind of dropped my jaw. The Council also understood this was an issue so right after becoming aware of it we put through a 3% COLA raise. It isn't the norm but it is a good COLA rate. We did the same thing again this year, with crunching the numbers and with inflation. Even if we keep doing these 3% raises it is still 8.64% behind still. So what this would do is normalize our pay to the point where we will be so far behind it would be ridiculous, and what Council Member Kent Nelson was talking about we need to fix the issues that got us here to begin with. In my mind it's what really looms large, this is the fifty percentile and I realize you hear a lot about it and it is true, the Green River factor, and there is nobody that wouldn't say they are a clone of Green River as we are unique. We can do the best that we can but we can compare ourselves as close as possible. No one is in the exact situation as we are, but in my mind our employees are top notch. It almost blows my mind both private and public sectors how fortune we are to have the individuals that we do and how

dedicated they are. Do I think they should be paid at the fifty percentile? The fifty percentile is right in the middle. Do I think our employees are mediocre? Absolutely not! They are so above that it is just not funny. We would love to be able to pay them six figures but that just isn't realistic, is it? You do the best you can without breaking the bank.

Royd Hatt commented, I agree with you that I would love to give everyone a raise in the whole town, but the only issue I have is, and I know it's been mentioned a lot today, is we get TSA money every year but they will not commit to give to us every year and we cannot attach it to salaries or we could go right down the tube in a couple of years. What we have done is to give the teachers a bonus. Mayor Bacon commented, right, it might not be available next year. Royd Hatt answered, right and we have done this for about five years and still we are not going to commit to something on going. So if its ongoing money that you know that you will be getting year after year that is great, if not I would recommend a bonus and the other thing is, I think Kent Nelson is right go to Emery County School District and look at our pay scale and DOT also has one. You will know exactly where you are. You'll start here and if I am here 13 years then I will be up here. If I get some certification or education, I get my PHD at the School District and you will know exactly what your shooting for all the time. There will be no surprise in to the budget there will be no surprises to the employees. Ren Hatt answered, in answer to Bryan Meadows point on that, there is always going to be a difference in opinion or mediation going on where you should start or this is the step I feel I should be in. There might be some countering, like we can't quite pay you on that step right now, but if you are here in 3 years you will be half of that if we start here. We want everyone to be paid fair. I don't want Bryan Meadows job. I don't want to canoe on the sewer lagoons. That is not anything any of us would want to do. We do think there are multiple facets to consider like Kent Nelson is talking about having something in place or at least something close as possible and pass it all at once and hopefully you can get your negotiations done in time to decide what steps your people are on and all that stuff. You'll have plenty of time to figure out all that stuff. Loni Meadows questioned that we started all that about 3 years ago when the Council said go out and do the research. I started with it for a while and eventually Conae Black just took charge of it. We also paid a company called PayScale to do this for us. Their system wasn't tweakable for Green River for instance, Doreen Lehnhoff has four different jobs and four actual duties in the sense they were paid for multiple job duties. Doreen Lehnhoff had four different job titles and four different wages. The system wasn't able to be tweaked to fit our situation. The previous Council is the ones that actually ask Conae Black to research this. She has taken her assignment and then gone with it and now the comment was, so did we just pay someone to go out and find themselves a raise? So who's assignment is this anyway? Right now this current Council is saying they want to be part of it, which does make total sense, but what happens when we all get together to vote and there is two for and two against? So who takes over and does it? We can't afford to hire another company to do that for us and that is why we brought Cameron Willford in on it with his expertise and also because Cameron Willford could take light off us employees finding ourselves a raise. So who is going to be in charge to take charge in this if Conae Black is denied the right to go and find our raises. Bo Harrison answered, if we could get a plan like the school board step and grade which shows where you are and where you're going to be I would be interested in doing this. Loni Meadows answered, we have looked out to our county and we have all those figures and the Council denied it basically so that is when they went with PayScale. Kent Nelson commented, we have another year and a few months before anyone changes on this Council. I said I would do it, Bo Harrison said he would, so let's get it done before another Council changes. If it's put in as a law it will not change. Loni Meadows commented, do we not trust our City Recorder who has been here for twenty plus years or your City Treasurer who does the figures and payroll? They say, we do not trust your figures therefore we are going to have to do it ourselves. I think being part of our discussion is totally one hundred percent reasonable, but to come right out and say we do not trust your figures. It is hard to be hit with that. Conae Black commented, I am not offended by it. Kent Nelson answered, that is the hard part about this position, you have to say hard things and people are going to take them in a different way. You can always justify most anything you want with research. Not that we did not trust you guys, we just want to see more of the figures. Like Bo Harrison said, we just saw what you wanted us to see, does that make sense? Bo Harrison

commented, we felt blind-sided at the meeting the other day, they put some numbers on the board and we are thinking where did this come from? Twenty percent raises seem a little bit overkill. Can we take gradual steps to get there? Can we take the opportunity to get there? Not all at once, that is hard for me to swallow. As a business owner this how I would run my business. Mayor Bacon commented, yes I can see how twenty percent could be sticker shock, but not when their wages are so low. Bo Harrison commented, I looked at them and they are not that low. Our Green River employees are doing really good, compared to the economy here in Green River they are doing awesome. Add in their benefits and they are doing better. Loni Meadows commented, most employees have to work a second job to make ends meet. Bryan Meadows commented, almost all of them work another job. Bridget Meadows commented, we are not doing that great. Bryan Meadows commented, if you're looking at the total with benefit package, we do not bring that benefit money home, it's there but we do not see it. Bo Harrison commented, it still costs the tax payers money. Kent Nelson stated, as a school teacher I also work multiple jobs, I am the ditch rider and City Councilman. Phillip Stubblefield commented, we don't have the summer off to do those extra jobs we work full time all year long. Kent Nelson commented, I understand. I work every weekend. Bo Harrison commented, I wish I only worked 40 hours a week. Kent Nelson commented, yes I understand you just want one job and I understand that you want a raise but don't throw all this stuff at me. Give me a system where it is consistent so when I am sitting here again four or five years from now asking for the same thing over again. Mayor Bacon said, I think what Cameron Willford is working on is a cafeteria program, I will be honest with you I was a chief opponent of straightway step and grade system. It is flexible and people will be getting raises that shouldn't be getting raises. Ren Hatt commented, the evaluation should take care of that. Phillip Stubblefield commented, I should caution you about using bonuses with step increases, it might feel like a good thing to give them one thousand dollars every year. If you do that for a number of years you are still at this pay level. Those step increases or percentages of COLA keep you coming up. When I was Police Chief it would upset my people when I hired someone making one hundred dollars or a thousand less a year than those that had been there ten years. I had to do that to keep them there or they were going to go somewhere else. I had to keep them at a higher wage than the newly hired employee. Yes, bonuses are great if you're not getting anything else. Royd Hatt said, if you do not have the money next year then you are in trouble. What will be worse is when you take it away after giving it to them. Next year maybe that grant or may you didn't have the Museum Director and then when you get the Museum Director you will no longer have that money where are you going to get it from? It's great to have a wage increases, as long as it is ongoing money that's great, but what if it's not? Phillip Stubblefield said, on a positive note we are getting an 82 room motel that will bring more money into the city. The Mayor, Conae Black, Robin Hunt and I are working for economic development. We are working towards getting more people to live here, more houses. Epicenter is working on that which in turn will provide for more revenue. I think there is a bright future. Mayor Bacon said, it is going to be the best day of my life when our ship comes in. When we actually make things happen. Phillip Stubblefield commented, if I were younger 15 or 20 years ago would I come to Green River to live? I left a job where I was paid 8 hours vacation every pay period to 4 hours here. Twenty years ago working for the Emery County Sheriff Dept. I received 8 hours of vacation per pay period then. Ren Hatt commented, I think that if we meet somewhere in the middle with a small raise and a moderate step and grade those are two compatible systems. Mayor Bacon commented, "What we are hoping for is what Cameron Willford is working on. In my opinion a straight wage and grade is not a good system, I think the Council should take a look at it and they should think about a bonus option. When you're talking about public money and tax payer's' dollars it is a concern. We need to take the best practices we can for the town and the employee. Sometimes it hard to find the perfect balance. Kathy Ryan commented, as a Council we need to be there for our employees. In the beginning I was listening to the people about what they thought and what they saw. You do not see the love and input that these employees put into their jobs and their community. You haven't walked in their shoes you do not know what they do. We need to get something set and in place for these employees so they are getting a raise every year and getting something set in stone so they do not have to go thru this so they can make a living. They work well together and they work as a team. Mayor Bacon said, we're all on the same page, we all have a different opinion on how to get there but

we still have a common goal. Kent Nelson, commented, give me a system to look at not just some figures. Kathy Ryan said, you'll have to give more of yourself as a Council person, to give input and do some research too. Kent Nelson said, Bo Harrison did some research but no one liked it. You could come and ask for some research that has been done already. Darcie Quist commented, I am surprised these employees stayed on as long as they have. You should be grateful they have that commitment. In the city these guys would be gone in a heartbeat. Kent Nelson said, it is the same reason we all stay here. We are not staying here because we make a lot of money but because we like it here. Bridget Meadows commented, it is fun to wait thru one Council for a new Council to get in. They do not work a forty-hour week it is way more. Mayor Bacon said, so everyone knows Cameron Willford surveyed about 30 cities, 10 in Idaho and about 20 in Utah and for the record Cameron Willford is not getting a raise at all. Bo Harrison said he finds that interesting, I wish I had the time to go thru every single piece of the data Cameron Willford had brought. It was all good stuff. I noticed one Deputy Recorder that was making about \$80, 000. It seems to be all over the place. Bo Harrison wondered how many were researched. He researched about 7 or 8. Julie Spadafora asked, did you get jobs for only one thing? The thing you do not see or realize is they all do a lot of different jobs and it wasn't until I started this job that I realized just how much they really do. Conae Black does an array of different things that people have no idea about and they do not appreciate her. I watch the guys with the crew who are good employees and you think well they are just a dime a dozen and if they do not work out we can just hire someone different every two to three years. That's so foolish when you get a good crew you want to keep them. The crew gets along and they do their work well and they do not have to be asked to do everything. People just do not understand because you do not spend enough time around the City Offices and see exactly what they do. They're never just standing around. I know that they say there are two people out there reading meters and guess what? I am the person that takes those readings and it use to take at least five days to complete that but Chad Pinneo has made things computerized so it takes half the time to do that and in turn makes my job easier. Mayor Bacon Commented, not only has it gotten faster they have done it with less man power. Julie Spadafora commented, don't make judgments when you never here to see it. Bo Harrison commented, I have never had problems with the City's output. There has been more being done in the last two years than ever before. I can see that. I know that and I appreciate it. The wages that is going for some of these positions, that is my issue. Conae Black said, you do not realize how long it takes what you have seen in the past 2 years to get done. Bo Harrison answered, I am ok with the raise just not a 20% raise. Phillip Stubblefield, commented, those two jobs are probably the two highest positions within the City. If you were to replace them you're going to pay a lot more. They will not do the work Conae Black does. I can guarantee you do not realize the work and output Conae Black does for the City, grants to all aspects of the city government not to mention all the certifications Bryan Meadows has. That's the problem you will never get someone to come here unless you're going to pay higher wages. That's is always what happens. Phillip Stubblefield commented, when I first moved here Dwendle Wilcox worked for the county and he wanted a raise. They wouldn't give it to him so he quit and they hired Tom Maughn and I at a higher wage. That will always happen. Bridget Meadows said, so when you decide to do a tour set aside a date for streets a date for sewer and a date for water the plant. You'll also need to set aside a date to call the state for grants. Don't forget all these different hats they wear. They are not so replaceable. Bo Harrison commented, as representing the tax payer I feel obligated. Conae Black said, you're still going to have these same dedicated employees show up for work tomorrow. Phillip Stubblefield, commented, we appreciate you guys, you are representing the citizens and looking out for their best interest. Bo Harrison commented, I talked to about twenty in the community and they are not for this raise. I think they didn't know that there was going to be a raise. All it said on the meeting was the fiscal year budget. Kathy Ryan, asked, how are you presenting it to the people? Did you know the City is looking into a fifty thousand-dollar raise for its employees? It's hard to come to a meeting and tell them, no to their face. Kathy Ryan commented, I don't think they understand. Mayor Bacon commented, like Kent Nelson said, you can back up anything with data. Bo Harrison asked, can we put this on the ballot this year and let the community vote on it? Conae answered, no. Conae said, that is why they vote for you. This has been debated a lot I would really like to move on. I didn't put it on the agenda and we cannot vote on it. Based on the

last meeting, there would be two voting yes and two voting no because Mike Silliman is not here to vote, so the Mayor would vote yes to break the tie. I didn't put it on the agenda we cannot act on it tonight. I think we are hammering it into the ground. Bo Harrison said, I wouldn't pass it the way it is and Ken Nelson wouldn't pass it either. Larry Packer commented, I wouldn't pass it. Bo Harrison said, we are going to have to make some adjustments to it then. We are going to have to revisit it again because it is not going to pass the way it is. Kent Nelson said, what are we going to do to make sure this doesn't happen with the next Council? Kathy Ryan said, this Council's going to need to work hard and we are going to make it happen. Ken Nelson said, I here willing to do my job and don't appreciate being called out saying I am not willing to do it. Kathy Ryan commented, well this happened with other Councils and they didn't do anything. Kent Nelson and Kathy Ryan both commented, let's get it done! Mayor Bacon said, we just need to be aware of the COLA issue and make sure we get that each year. Moving forward.

5. Discuss/approve/deny renewing contract with River Restoration.

Conae Black presented to the Mayor and Council the new contract with River Restoration. You will fund it under Capital Projects Fund / Economic Development. Mayor Bacon commented that this is going to make Green River a destination rather than a pit stop. It is in our budget for the fiscal year and this contract will be very beneficial for the City of Green River. **MOTION:** Bo Harrison made a motion to approve the renewal of the River Restoration contract. Kathy Ryan seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Bo Harrison, Kent Nelson, Kathy Ryan and Larry Packer voted aye. The motion carried.

6. Discuss/approve/deny establishing a Green River Newsletter.

Robin Nelson addressed the Council about writing a monthly or bi weekly newsletter in the ETV News which has been greatly ignored because of the lack of Green River happenings. This would keep the towns people better informed about what goes on in City Council and fun happenings in Green River. It will not be too long only about a page. Hoping that Green River residence will read it for a change instead of just tossing it. Robin is willing to be the editor, but we will need to decide how to distribute it. They discussed putting it on social media, distributing flyers which would reach our older generation. She hasn't seen as many participants on social media nor are there many followers. Ideas were mentioned about the High School English class helping to write articles and Gayna Salinas suggested asking to have a full page dedicated to just Green River and then advertising to let the community know so they could count on that. **MOTION:** Kent Nelson made a motion to approve the Newsletter. Larry Packer seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Kent Nelson, Bo Harrison, Kathy Ryan and Larry Packer voted aye. The motion carried.

7. Discuss/approve/deny moving forward with a Class IV landfill.

The Council discussed where to put the landfill and whether the State would approve it. Phillip Stubblefield mentioned the State would be receptive of the same location because it has previously been a landfill. One location would be on East end of town in a small valley where you are not going to see it from the freeway. The Council asked whether it would be detrimental to our Industrial Park area. It was clarified that it would be unseen from the road and would not be detrimental. The type of trash that would be accepted there would be construction and demolition waste. The landfill would save the City from having a construction dumpster at the transfer station resulting in a savings of about \$10,000 per year and it should be self-sustaining. Phillip Stubblefield asked to hire Johansen and Tuttle Engineering to help us with the application to the State. Engineering will include, archaeological survey, water drainage, and calculate the capacity. **MOTION:** Bo Harrison, made the motion to approve moving forward with a Class IV landfill. Kent Nelson seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Kent Nelson, Bo Harrison, Kathy Ryan and Larry Packer voted aye.

8. Department and employee reports.

Robin Hunt- Reported on the Vallejo Family Pumpkin Contest, Outlaw Day's scheduled for the 6th and 7th of November, High School involved in the Cowboy Poetry, Virtual Swell search and Quarterly Trail Meetings. Bryan Meadows- reported on the Sanitary Survey with Division of

Drinking Water Director, painted the storage tanks with rubberized paint, helped Rhett Wilcox with a water issue, repairing the river pump for the 2nd time, I Camp is ready to test a sample for E. coli in the new water system at the trailer park. City crew chopped weeds at the gun range. Phillip Stubblefield- People are moving and cleaning up still. The City Crew helped move the equipment down the side of Green River Ave. making it now possible to mow down the weeds. Looking good now. Citations will now be used on violations for Animal control. County has agreed to a prosecutor and will be Judge Stream. Animal Control Office is up for hire. Enforcement side is lacking. We now have our Crystal Water Rights. Conae Black- Completed our Annual Field Audit. New Museum director will be starting work on Oct, 21,2020. We lost our janitor and Kelsie Hart at the Museum, it will up to our new Director get these positions filled. This had been the month of grants. The Safe Roads to School Grant, Boater Access Grant, National Park Service and the Brownfield Grant. We will be getting our digital reader board in place before the ground is frozen. We found a really good location on the State Park property next to Main Street. Airport FAA Competitive bid. Armstrong was the only one to place a bid and is the current bidder in place. With Capital Improvements we will be extending the run way and getting snow removal equipment for the airport. We are about 95% complete on our Master Plan. Kathy Ryan- October 22nd is our Weed Spray Day. They will have Milestone which is specifically for Russian Nape Weed which is very expensive and works best in the fall. We are working on the release of the water from the Flaming Jorge Dam with Curtis Rozman. The Teen Center building was cleaned up and looking good.

9 Adjourn. The meeting adjourned at 9:52 p.m.

Travis Bacon, Mayor

Conae Black, City Recorder

Approved: December 8, 2020